The Emerging PPP Paradigm: Overview and Outlook

January 10, 2012
North Carolina House Select Committee on Public-Private Partnerships
Raleigh, NC

Leonard Gilroy
Director of Government Reform
Reason Foundation | reason.org
Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) Defined

- PPPs—a.k.a. privatization, contracting out, outsourcing, competitive sourcing, competitive tendering—is simply a contract between governments and private sector (for-profit and nonprofit) firms in the delivery of public services.

- Ranges from simple contracting to large-scale asset sales and joint ventures; taps private capital in most powerful versions.
  - Involves some combination of operations, maintenance, design, construction and/or financing in delivery of assets or services.

- PPPs are simply policy tools—they can be effective when used well and ineffective when used incorrectly.

- PPPs introduce competition into an otherwise monopolistic system of public service delivery.

- Competition promotes innovation, cost savings, efficiency and greater effectiveness in serving the shifting demands of customers.
Competition is Key to 21st Century Government

- Government’s role is evolving from service provider to provider & broker of services
- Government has come to rely far more on networks of public, private and non-profit organizations
- PPPs now seen as a proven policy management tool to deliver better services at a lower cost
- “[T]he fastest way to save money and increase value is to force public institutions to compete.”—David Osborne and Peter Hutchinson, *The Price of Government*
Competition is Key to 21st Century Government (cont’d)

• "It is better for the public to procure at the market whatever the market can supply; because there it is by competition kept up in its quality, and reduced to its minimum price.”—Thomas Jefferson, 1808

• "It is not a government's obligation to provide services, but to see that they are provided.”—former New York Governor Mario Cuomo

• “Privatize everything you can.”—Chicago Mayor Richard Daley’s advice to incoming DC mayor
Surging Interest in PPPs

- Fiscal conditions driving increasing interest in PPPs, from small-scale outsourcing to infrastructure PPPs that leverage private $$.

- Transportation is leading edge of U.S. infrastructure PPP market:
  - 31 states have transportation PPP enabling legislation.
  - Over $7B in Texas highway PPP projects under construction; over $2B underway in Florida and Virginia each.

- PPP wave is starting to broaden to include social infrastructure:
  - Puerto Rico's PPP program (2009)
  - TX Senate Bill 1048 (2011): PPPs for schools, water & wastewater projects, transit, ports and other public use facilities.
Common Goals of PPPs

• **Cost Savings**
  • Rule of thumb—10-25% on average (+/-)

• **Service/Quality Improvements**
  • Competitive bidding; performance guarantees

• **Innovation**
  • Static processes, red tape obstacles to public sector innovation

• **Enhanced Risk Management**
  • Key risks (cost, delivery, liabilities) can be transferred from public to private sector

• **Accelerated Delivery**
  • Competitive contracting, performance incentives

• **In the case of infrastructure PPPs, deploying private capital to develop/rebuild public assets**
  • Toll roads, higher education facilities, parking assets, courthouses, etc.
Where Can Governments Apply PPPs?

- Vehicle fleet operations, maintenance & ownership
- Core IT infrastructure & network, web & data processing
- Administrative support services (e.g., HR, payroll, accounting, mail, printing, etc.)
- Risk management (claims admin, loss prevention, etc.)
- Park operations & maintenance
- Road, building, facility maintenance
- Facilities financing, operations & maintenance
- Higher education facility construction (including financing), maintenance & non-instructional services
- Corrections and mental health (facility construction and management; health care & food services; programming)
- Revenue-generating assets (toll roads, liquor stores, parking assets, etc.)
- Core infrastructure (roads/transit, water, airports, schools, etc.)
State Policymakers are Thinking Bigger on PPPs

Examples:

- **Puerto Rico**: created PPP Authority in 2009; since 2010, entered into PPP to rebuild 100 K-12 schools; signed $1.4 billion toll road lease; initiated San Juan airport modernization PPP procurement.

- **Ohio**: in 2011, enacted transportation PPP law; converted economic development agency to a PPP; soliciting advisors for Ohio Turnpike & state lottery leases.

- **Illinois**: 10-year lottery management PPP underway to generate $1 billion in new revenues to state; new transportation PPP law in 2011.

- **Georgia**: Large-scale, secure-site facility maintenance PPP for 48 facilities across Dept. of Corrections, Juvenile Justice, GFBI; new law authorizing water reservoir PPPs.

- **Virginia**: has used PPP authority to develop highways, rebuild psychiatric and correctional facilities, modernize state IT architecture, revamp Interstate maintenance and more.
Local Policymakers Continue to Embrace PPPs

Examples:

• *Chicago*: >$3B in parking asset and toll road leases under former Mayor Daley. Mayor Rahm Emanuel announced PPP for recycling services in 2011.

• *Indianapolis*: entered into 50-year, $620 million concession with ACS to operate parking meter system; various other outsourcing projects.

• *Los Angeles*: LA MTA pursuing several PPP highway projects; current PPP initiatives for L.A. Zoo, animal shelter; pursued PPP for nine city parking garages in 2010.

• *Charlotte*: 16+ year successful managed competition program; dozens of city services competed (public vs. private).

• *GA Contract Cities*: Sandy Springs incorporates as “contract city” in 2005; contractors provide nearly 100% of non-safety operational and admin services; 2 other cities incorporated & use similar model; now ~150,000 Metro Atlanta citizens served by largely privatized city gov’t.
Keys to Success:
Some Global Best Practices in PPPs

• Establish PPP center of excellence to guide process, implementation
  • Central management, consolidated expertise
  • Enterprise-wide approach brings consistency
  • "Best value" selection
  • Conduct business case/Value for Money analysis for projects
  • Examples: Puerto Rico PPP Authority, Partnerships BC

• Establish clear, predictable legal framework for PPPs
  • No legislative approval of PPP contracts (political risk)
  • Allow blending of public and private funds to finance projects

• In infrastructure, attract market interest with a project pipeline
  • Don't pursue PPP projects, build a PPP program
  • Broaden scope beyond transportation to social infrastructure
Develop performance metrics and goals, and build these goals and benchmarks into the contract.
  • Tie vendor payment to performance.

Utilize “best value” contracting.
  • “Low bid” isn’t necessarily the “best” bid—governments should choose the best mix of quality, cost and other factors.

Develop strong oversight and monitoring and protocols before entering into a contract to ensure compliance.
  • Government’s role does not end with contract signing; rather, role shifts to rigorous monitoring and contract management.

Communicate early and often with stakeholders, public, media
Ongoing Challenges for PPPs

- **Education gap**: lack of public, policymaker understanding.
- **Skills gap**: states and local governments have limited PPP procurement expertise.
- **Management gap**: PPPs are paradigm shift in public management.
- **Policy gap**: weak legal & policy framework.
- **Opposition**: public sector labor, environmental orgs, ideologues.
- **Fear**: loss of public control; sale vs. lease; profit.
- **Inertia**: public systems can be slow to embrace change, innovation.
- **Complexity**: many steps from concept to implementation.
- Risks of the status quo are poorly understood.
Questions?

Leonard Gilroy, AICP
Director of Government Reform
Reason Foundation

leonard.gilroy@reason.org
(713) 927-8777
www.reason.org